

SOUTH SYDNEY AMATEUR FISHING ASSOCIATION INC

PO BOX 328, MATRAVILLE NSW 2036



Michael Daly MP
Member for Maroubra
Suite 501, Level 5
806 Anzac Parade, Maroubra
NSW 2035

14th March 2006

PORT BOTANT EXPANSION SERCTION 96(1A) MODIFICATION Wharf Structure Design

Dear Michael,

Attached is the Section 96(1A) Modification for the wharf structure, however we have yet been able to find and official documentation relating to Foreshore Beach or Penrhyn Estuary changes.

I have also studied the Final Report for the Ecological Impacts of Proposed Modifications to Seawall at Port Botany.

What is of great concerns is that the final conclusion is inconclusive, more research is needed.

Reading the modification application it is evident that the only benefit will be a positive dollar saving for SPC whilst potentially costing the community more in terms of loss of habitat that the original wharf structure will have provided. Once again this is reckless reclamation without any regard for the environment. What is also disappointing is the notion that SPC is absolved of any environmental enhancement because of the re-building of the runway by other parties, this is arrogance at its best and highlights the contempt SPC has showed the community over the past few years.

Anecdotally, all fishers and fisheries managers will agree that shaded areas under wharves provide habitat and cover for all estuary fish, from the humble Bream to the majestic Mulloway. We have been asked to accept that the new NSW marine parks will benefit recreational angling and fish stocks due to the 'spill over effect' that a pristine habitat and sanctuary will provide. The original wharf structure will operate in much the same way, a sanctuary zone not accessible to recreational anglers.

Historically, recreational anglers were able to access Brotherson Dock, and the wharves situated in the Dock provided access to bait such as whitebait, yellowtail and squid, pelagics like Bonito and Mackerel and super predators like Mulloway. Long after recreational anglers have been banned from the Dock, those with access to the area still catch all these fish, including the Mulloway. If we were to apply a spillover effect model, more cover = more habitat = more fish and therefore subsequent spill over into the surrounding areas of Botany Bay.

Stan Konstantaras
President
South Sydney Amateur Fishing Association
Phone: 9344-0331
Mobile: 0407 131 714
Email: pastelli@netspace.net.au

Visit us at southsydneyafa.com.au

I have selected another 5 documents from the same researchers SPC used that support seawalls, shaded wharves and marinas as a means of enhancing habitat. All these documents have one thing in common is that we need more research before we can unequivocally say that there is not net loss from going from a shaded seawall to a vertical seawall similar to what SPC want to do. I also feel that the positives of a shaded area far outweigh a vertical wall, common sense tell me this.

My first reaction is that we will have a size increase in the reflected wave.

Apart from the positive saving to SPC, recreational anglers will see a bigger wave on their ramp with the new vertical wall. I am deeply concerned that Runway Stabilisation Works have been used in the new modelling. What the test have failed to consider is that this new Runway Stabilisation Work will not be effective in very high tides. With periods around the full moon delivering tide heights to 2 meters, these tests need to be assessed again during these higher tides. A subsurface wave break or absorber that SPC claims the Runway Stabilisation Works will become will be ineffective during our higher tides. These occur approximately 12 weeks of the year, not one day of the year.

Using mean sea levels is not an appropriate way to model these wave heights.

This section 96(1A) is **not** appropriate. More testing is needed and larger parameters need to be considered in the SPC models. SPC's bottom line should not outweigh potential community benefits that the original model provided.

Yours sincerely

Stan Konstantaras
President SSAFA
President ANSA NSW